

## **BOOK REVIEWS**

**Nikhil Ananad.** 2017. *Hydraulic City: Water and the Infrastructures of Citizenship in Mumbai*, Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Scholarly works on water identifying various aspects of its relationship with human and non-humans are in significant numbers. They have qualitatively influenced our understanding on life and livelihoods as well as the rise and decay of societies and civilizations over space and time vis-a-vis water. This book is surely a worthy addition to that repository. Overtly, it provides a detailed analogy of *water* and its associated paraphernalia in the Indian city of Mumbai but covertly, through its field based insights, it allows the readers to collate and compare how the contents of debates in contemporary India changed abruptly within a short span of time; i.e. from locating the ‘gaps’ in identifying the constitutionally accepted rights and provisions for citizens to a *milieu* which talks less about provisions but questions fundamentally citizenship itself by casting aspersions on who is an Indian citizen.

Citizenship determined solely through documents are an arduous process, where one agency of the state verifies documents as ‘proofs’ issued by another, as if the state simultaneously doubts and resolves itself through documentary evidences. In this regard, there has been a perceptible shift in India today. In a chapter titled *Settlement*, there is an interesting observation, how even unintended documents were treated as adequate proof for justifying belongingness to a place — of course, after it was accepted by the Court of law. Quoting an incident, the author cites how a housing activist ‘had

successfully used a previously issued (but unexecuted) eviction order as a proof of tenancy to prevent evictions when the bulldozers came around several years later. The court accepted the document as proof of address and occupation and stayed the demolition’ (p. 88). Contrast this incident with a recent court ruling (February 2020),<sup>1</sup> where after submission of 15 documents as proofs, the court rejected the appeal of a ‘citizen’ to citizenship. Scanning through the pages of this book replete with such anecdotes endows us with numerous insights that, when compared with the emerging realities, reminds us of the dialectical relationship between the state and its citizens in India today.

Spread over six chapters and interludes, an Introduction and an insightful Preface, this book discusses how 3.4 billion litres of water is collected more than a hundred kilometres away from the city to be transferred and distributed in 110 hydraulic zones in Mumbai to hydrate 13 million residents every day — with the help of five hundred water engineers and seven thousand laborers of Hydraulic Engineering Department and ‘a mass of silent others’ who enable the process (p. 1).

Chapter 1 (*Scarce Cities*) provides the context to the study by highlighting the dissonance in the process of urbanisation and urban provisions to its residents in cities located in colonial heartlands (London, Paris, etc.) and hinterlands e.g. Bombay (Mumbai) (p. 35). In the former, urbanisation catered to ‘the needs of an expansive urban public’ (p. 35), while in the later, urban provisioning from its inception was based on ‘a limited domain of liberal citizens and remaining subjects’ (pp. 35-6).

This binary has continued in the post-colonial era as well, where the estimated (!) average of 240 litres of water per person per day (p. 38) does not reach 60% of Mumbai's population residing in slums and chawls (p. 43). The chapter provides a brilliant insight regarding how this approximation of per capita requirement is calculated through a process of 'enduring scarcity' (p. 36) and 'management of silences' (p. 41). Inability to access water by the villagers of Shahpur taluk in the Thane district, a place where water is collected by controlling five dams on three rivers and then transferred to Mumbai with an assumption of '863 million litres of loss in the system per day' (p. 38), illustrates the cross sectionalities of distributive justice (or a lack of it) both between the agrarian and the urban and within the urban as well.

The second Chapter titled *Settlement*, a term which has been used by Anand instead of slums and chawls, describes how water influences the politics in the everyday life of settlers in the Jogeshwari and Premnagar settlements as well as how politics shapes water provisioning in these areas. Moving beyond the duality of civil and political society, the author emphasises the fluidity of urban life and the importance of different kinds of *relations* both formal and informal in shaping the life of the settlers as hydraulic citizens. Beyond the market and the state, this chapter exhibits 'the practices of friendship and helping' which although 'ambiguous are marked by excess — an excess that carries the relation forward into the future' (p.78). Through several case studies these ambiguous relationships are explained. The transformation, on the part of the thought process of the state from

advocating slum *erasure to improvement* (p. 82) has also been a manifestation in this direction. While the state works hard *not to count* and *not to know* certain populations as liberal citizens for urban provisioning, the settlers through extraordinary social and political work gain access to the same (p. 89). A process that suggest the settlers simultaneously 'live at once in multiple regimes of sovereignty and rationality' (p. 94).

'Residents of Mumbai have long been governed by the time of water' (p. 97) and the third chapter is thereby titled *Time Pe or On Time*. Scarcities and excesses mark urban living and a common sensical understanding would be to rationalise both the extremes so that regularity of flow is maintained. But fieldwork quoted in this chapter highlights that settlers are not in favour of 24 hours of water; rather they would prefer limited flows *on time* but with adequate water pressure. Eight hundred valves control the flow and pressure of water operated by *chaviwallas* (key people) (p. 101), who decide the temporality of water availability which in turn determines the everyday life of the city dwellers especially the settlers. The social life in the settlements and the gendered forms of personhood gets determined by water and its time of supply and thereby instead of claiming water, anytime, they prefer to have it at right time' (p. 123).

Where 'relations, kinship and friendship' (p. 133) plays an important role instead of universal citizens' right to public goods, *social work* provides an important alibi for establishing contacts with those 'who matter' for enabling hydraulic citizenship. Social organisations provide

the platform for connecting the ‘people who matter’ and the settlers, so that a mutually beneficial relationship is generated where the former enables public provisioning of goods and the later sustain them as voters during elections. Many organisations undertaking social work are thereby empowered by ‘infrapower’ (p. 136). Chapter 4 focuses on one social organisation named Asha and its office bearer to analyse the interplay of infrapolitics in the life of settlers and the ‘people who matter’.

In such a huge and widespread network of collection, storage and distribution of water, what is the level of leakage in the system! Chapter 5 aptly titled as *Leaks* analyses this aspect both in terms of reflections of the engineers as well as a social process. Anand explains that ‘leaks’ are placed in between ‘ignorance and not yet known and ‘unknowable’ (p. 162). Determining the quantum of leaks, where ‘over half of the city’s water meters remain out of service’ (p. 165) and the accompanying ‘politics of estimation’ falls within the ‘gap’ of knowledge and ignorance associated with the physicality and the sociality of water. This ‘gap’, enabling ‘leak’, ‘allow people to live’ by placing them ‘beyond the accounting regimes’.

How was Mumbai able to sustain itself prior to its present system of water supply? Wells, springs, wetlands and other sources of ground and surface water hydrated the population until the colonial scheme of water supply was instated in 1860, where Bombay became ‘urban India’s first municipal project’ (p. 35). This transformation of the city into a hydraulic

city, however, is a process where other water sources gradually became unconnected and later disconnected; so was the case with hydraulic citizenship too, where a large section of the population remain disconnected to its grand water infrastructure. Chapter 6 titled *Disconnected* provides a vivid analysis of this process of everyday discrimination, abjection and deprivation in the life and making of the hydraulic citizenship in the metropolis. It is a story of Premnagar, a largely Muslim settlement. The settlement becomes a lived manifestation of the interplay of ‘cultural’ and ‘real’ politics in matters of public provisioning of water and through it, the creation of the ‘other’ who thereby are perpetually castigated for their ‘suspicious’ origins and ‘questionable’ hydraulic practices.

Nikhil Anand provides the readers a fascinating collection *on, about, and for* water and it is accompanying circular politics of ever-increasing estimations of scarcity and thus the perennial requirement for newer sources and engineering structures to keep a city hydrated. This unending circularity, however, falls short in ushering in an era of social contract, where emancipatory hydraulic citizenship is guaranteed.

#### Notes

<sup>1</sup><https://indianexpress.com/article/explained/explained-assams-citizenship-test-papers-6291710/>

Gorky Chakraborty

Institute of Development Studies, Kolkata (IDSK)

[gorky8bob@gmail.com](mailto:gorky8bob@gmail.com)

**Michael Batty.** 2018. *Inventing Future Cities*. Cambridge: The MIT Press.

Michael Batty's most recent book, 'Inventing Future Cities' deserves more attention from academics, urban planners and policy makers than it has been accorded. One of the key reasons for this is that it largely succeeds at informing both the academic field of urban studies and more practice-related concerns surrounding urban governance by state-related institutions and their representatives. It is, therefore, a testament to Batty's scholarly depth and breadth of knowledge to be able to engage these broad domains as a whole. Readers seeking a singular work that enables one to reflect on the complex issues that cities of both the present and future encounter will find Batty's insights valuable. This is partly because Batty avoids the all too familiar and simplistic approach taken by other writers at promoting grand narratives that too confidently predict the future of cities. Instead, he offers a far more realistic and intellectually humble perspective, claiming that we can never truly know what the future of cities will be like. At best, one can only manage how we should 'think about cities', based on past and present knowledge. Batty subsequently seeks to justify this position throughout the rest of the book, identifying several arguments and providing real-life examples on how one can engage the various possibilities surrounding future cities. A key assumption of his arguments largely rests on the unpredictable nature of the city and the related topic of urban development, as he appeals to a range of perspectives by various scholars from his field and those

beyond. Particular theoretical attention is given to complexity theory, which serves as the philosophical foundations of this book and its conclusions.

Challenging rigid and one-dimensional discourses, Batty puts forward the argument of how cities of the future are complex multifaceted living systems that are largely self-organizing from the ground up, an analytical cornerstone of complexity theory. This is combined with a view that cities both today and tomorrow are sites of time-space compression, where diverse and diffused mobility-communication networks are no longer easily defined along geo-spatial boundaries (or as physical artifacts) that rely on measurements like density and size. As a result, he takes inspiration from Glaeser's paradox, where 'proximity becomes more important while the deterrent effect of distance is of lesser significance' to further highlight the qualitative differences that cities of the future will tend towards. He makes his case referencing largely from examples in the United Kingdom and other parts of Europe, showing how post-industrial cities of the present now require a paradigm shift in thinking about the future. As such, it is also important to note that the form of future cities may no longer necessarily follow their original function in a digital age. This is one outcome of the advent of technological advances that signal the emergence of 'smart cities', or what Batty labels the 'sixth Kondratieff wave', referring to the former Soviet scholar in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century who identified periodic economic cycles leading to 'waves of innovation' in society.

These are important arguments, as the complexity theory approach suggested by

Batty allows for greater dynamism in either scholarly studies of urbanity or policy-making. This is opposed to a kind of linear dogmatism employing a narrow view that privileges an economy-centric view of city growth. This often leads to incomplete analyses of urban systems with little regard for environmental, social-cultural or geo-political constraints and realities. Perhaps one of the best ways to examine the merits of Batty's arguments is to situate them in other contexts that he did not raise. The value of such views certainly finds clear relevance, for example, in the case of Singapore, a unique modern-city state in the heart of Southeast Asia, often heralded as an economic miracle and a model for sound governance. The island-state's urban planners and policy-makers have already taken a complexity theory approach to understand and sustain the layered and intricate factors leading to its economic success and present standards of high livability. Set within the broader context of climate change, this is particularly pertinent in view of Singapore's high population density, limited spatial capital, diverse ethnic makeup and its rapidly ageing population. The insights provided by Batty facilitate an integrated thinking framework to navigate research and policy-making in an increasingly digitized, globalized and culturally diverse world. And as already articulated by Batty, the need to adopt an intersecting and interdisciplinary systems approach is a crucial way forward in dealing with the unpredictable future of 'smart' cities or otherwise.

At the same time, one area that Batty could have elaborated further on was how cities, within and between themselves, are seldom homogenous spaces. In other words,

while he does acknowledge the multiplicity of processes and nuances in decision-making within cities, such complexity is often mired in inequalities and power differences that emerge from challenges like digital divides, ethnic enclaves and urban gentrification. Contending social-cultural, political and economic forces further entwine the urban experience of cities and their subsequent transformations. Cities, while the site of disruption, innovation and ambiguity, can be the site of exploitation, conflict and precarity. This is because cities are also lived spaces inhabited by people driven by competing interests and their attempts at sense-making. Batty had an opportunity to contextualize his arguments as such, but did not appear to devote enough substantial reflection on this, and virtually glosses over them. The same thing can be said about the rather marginal attention that climate change gets throughout the book's narrative. Nevertheless, not all this should distract the reader from the obvious and significant contribution of *Inventing Future Cities*. In more ways than one, Batty's book provides a continuation of a far older and ongoing intellectual examination of the connections between urbanity and industrialized society that first began with the emergence of the first urbanized cities in human history. It marks a positive step towards greater dialogue between academics, urban-based professionals and policy-makers that will enable a more grounded and comprehensive understanding about the future of cities.

Kevin S.Y. Tan

Centre for Liveable Cities, Singapore

[Siah\\_Yeow\\_TAN\\_from.TP@mnd.gov.sg](mailto:Siah_Yeow_TAN_from.TP@mnd.gov.sg)

**Michael Ian Borer.** 2019. *Vegas Brews: Craft Beer and the Birth of a Local Scene*. New York: New York University Press.

Michael Ian Borer's *Vegas Brews* looks at how the cultural logics of a city are both created and constrained through interactions and reputations. In particular, he looks at how denizens of Las Vegas try to create a local space in the midst of what many see as the ideal typical transnational city (i.e. one of constant motion, populated by non-citizens whose bodies are not bound by typical geographies but by capital). In response to the question how amidst a city built and run for the tourist class, can inhabitants and workers create a sense of place, his answer surprisingly, is through the interactional potential of the craft beer scene.

Craft beer, and craft in general, has become synonymous with the local; engaging in craft is a way to experience local culture and consume unique goods. The rise in craft has been at the forefront in the fight against globalization and corporate control over a range of products, including foodstuffs. Consuming craft beer is seen as a way to stick it to big beer, support local economies, and regain consumptive control. In many areas in the US, it has also been used as a mean to save downtown areas.

The rise in craft breweries and craft beer in general has been phenomenal. The US alone has gone from about 800 craft breweries to over 8,000 in the last 20 years. There are a number of states in the US that alone have more breweries than entire countries. The US is awash in good beer. And while many breweries have been both pilloried and praised for reappropriating

place, Borer sets his book in a unique place, Las Vegas.

Las Vegas is an urban simulacrum; it wants you to feel at home but has been simultaneously created to be a place that is the very antithesis of home. Within craft beer, the fight over craft versus crafty beer (large, macro brands posing products as craft beer) looms large, and there is probably no better place to look at the nuances of that fight than the ultimate crafty city — Las Vegas.

To rediscover the urban, Borer uses scenes as his object of study. Studying a city by looking at scenes, especially when looking at culture, allows Borer to locate both the production and consumption of culture. It allows one to learn the scripts of place and as Borer finds, to locate how people become re-encharmed with place. In doing so, he invites us on his journeys through Vegas, from craft breweries, to bottle swaps, to casinos, to dive bars. In each place we meet denizens of the craft beer scene who are trying to change local culture.

This is not always an easy task. Rather than ignore the elephant in the room, Borer names it—'Las Vegas Syndrome'. The inauthenticity of Vegas produces a representational constraint towards achieving an authentic culture. While most cities would kill for the urban branding and reputation that Vegas has, it constricts culture. The city is the product of a heavy-handed, top-down production of culture, rather than a bottom-up form of urban culture. Here craft beer becomes a symbolic battle over urban culture. Thus, Borer's fellow craft collaborators know

they are fighting a good fight, and that they get to do it with beer.

This battle is largely waged through interaction. Borer shows how taste is performed through tasting with others. His ethnographical pursuit of the meaning of craft beer goes deep into the rituals of drinking to show how Vegas gets reimagined through its ‘interactional potential’ (p. 91). His craft collaborators look forward to getting together to share bottles, to socializing new members into the craft scene, to building up local bottle shops, participating in craft beer conventions, and starting breweries. Borer notes that this ‘reappropriation of place’ is part of a ‘community found vs community lost narrative’ where ‘attentive civility’ — which is community or interacting with others in an intentional way produces a new kind of community (p. 133). As such, *Vegas Brews* is at the forefront of urban studies, one that focuses on the micro-intentionality of community members while keeping mezo-level barriers on the horizon.

Borer does get into the culture of craft. Here he shows how craft beer drinking is seen as different than other kinds of drinking. Drinkers are often interested in ‘Interactional accomplishments’, such as earning badges for acts of consumption, ticking off certain places in which to consume, and in earning status for imbibing (or more likely just collecting) whales—the rare one-off beer that immediately raises a brewery’s (and the collector’s) status. While such behaviour is natural in scenes, Borer also sees it as a tragedy of culture (p. 171). In particular, he sees it as ultimately a problem for bottom-up local culture, where ‘neoliberalism and capitalist encroachment

on leisure’ foster distinction in consumption. Thus, many of the participants in the scene are simply consuming in order to create a difference between themselves and others. This goes against the ethos of much craft consumption, but as others have shown, democracy and distinction are the warp and woof of urban culture.

In Borer’s more than capable hands, the craft scene becomes in part a resistance to the dominant other in the city; the ‘corporate-driven neon spectacle that most people outside of Las Vegas associate with the city’ (p. 6). Vegas is the most inauthentic city imaginable which makes it the perfect place to look for authenticity. Borer’s book is an ingenious attempt to look at the negotiations of place-making in the city. It is an academic tome to be sure, but highly readable to anyone interested in things urban, culture, or just beer.

Daina Cheyenne Harvey  
College of the Holy Cross  
[dharvey@holycross.edu](mailto:dharvey@holycross.edu)

---

**Barbara Heer.** 2019. *Cities of Entanglements. Social Life in Johannesburg and Maputo Through Ethnographic Comparison.* Bielefeld: transcript Verlag.

This thought provoking but at times difficult to read book is based on fourteen months of fieldwork conducted with the aid of three research assistants between 2010 and 2012 in Johannesburg — Alexandra (a less affluent/poor area) and Linbro Park (an élite/affluent area) — and in Maputo — Sommerschild II (an élite/affluent area) and Polana Caniço (a less affluent/poor area) for the author’s doctoral project.

Three aspects guided the research. Firstly, the evolvment of everyday lives in the four neighbourhoods. Secondly, the everyday movement of urban dwellers on paths and routes through the city whereby neighbourhoods were linked with workplaces, spaces of consumption and of worship elsewhere in the city. Thirdly, spaces where the lives of people from adjacent neighbourhoods become entangled.

The book consists of eight chapters, a postscript (on comparison in anthropology) and bibliography. The settings are outlined, the histories of the research areas sketched and concepts such as entanglements, space, urban milieus and agency are discussed.

In both cities the urban areas under study were unequal, and in both cases the more affluent neighbourhoods tried to manage the relations of proximity and distance between the insiders and those regarded as outsiders, often by erecting walls and other security measures. However, such measures on the organisation of space are only part of a more complex picture, as they reflect the views of the élites while the views of the less affluent are ignored. Here, these relations between people and spaces, and the attendant different views, are defined as ‘entanglements’. These entanglements, mostly recognised by the less powerful, challenge the élite’s desire for segregation. Entanglements and encounters are complementary terms, where encounters refer to instances of engagement across difference and entanglements involve the social relationships that come about through such encounters.

As a result of colonialism and apartheid, cities like Johannesburg and Maputo came to be seen in terms of binary categories of difference like Black and White, European and Natives (segregation) and, in spite of changes that have taken place, these binaries still influence how the inhabitants try and make sense of their worlds and how cities are being analysed. Entanglements are shaped by the history of each city but also by the entanglements between the two cities.

Using entanglements as a point of departure, it is argued, helps to address shortcomings in urban anthropology and urban studies. First, Heer points to what she calls mosaic thinking in urban research that focuses on the single neighbourhood. Space is understood to be absolute and cities thereby seen as consisting of distinct parts, each with their own identity and with clear boundaries between them. Entanglements show how these different urban worlds are not totally disconnected and segregated. Second, Heer criticises the division between an emphasis on location and place-making and one on networks. Looking at the city through entanglements, she argues, will provide a new understanding of the reality of urban life between urban segregation and mobile, connected lives. Third, ‘[...] scholarship of conviviality in urban spaces often overemphasises the significance of interactions in publicly owned public spaces [...]’ (p.30). In her view, analysing entanglements helps us to understand that the different spaces of urban life — suburban homes, religious spaces and shopping malls — are linked to each other and are seen in relation to each other. The fourth shortcoming relates to the



methodologies of comparisons. Amidst all the debates about the politics of urban theorising, epistemologies and typologies of comparisons, Heer maintains, few practical answers are given as to how comparison as a qualitative ethnographic method can be used.

There is a spatial dimension to urban entanglements. Three interrelated concepts — namely, space, milieus and agency — need to be used in order to understand ethnographically and analyse such urban entanglements.

Space can be relative (the spatial relationship between objects), relational (the space brought about by relationships) and absolute (such as a fixed geographical space or bounded phenomena). Heer bases cities of entanglements on a relational and relative understanding of space. Social space, she writes, ‘[...] is constructed, negotiated and experienced in the situations of everyday life through the interplay of three dimensions, namely, through (1) the material, (2) the conceived and (3) lived space.’ (p.32). What needs to be taken into account is that there is a difference between Western and African forms of knowledge production regarding space.

Urban social milieus (groups of like-minded people) found in an urban area are brought about by entanglements through the social situations in which people interact with one another in everyday life. Therefore, because of people’s agency, entanglements are fluid, shifting and subject to chance while also being influenced by patterns from the past.

Chapters two, three and four address the entanglements regarding Alexandra and Linbro Park respectively and examine how

the urban populations of the two areas became entangled in spite of apartheid. Heer explains how neighbourhoods, urban dissimilarities and entanglements become reconstructed as material, social and imaginary realities. In Maputo, two main issues direct the discussion. One concerns the efforts by the élite property owners of Sommerschild II to close off their neighbourhood from Polana Caniço by building a wall across the common access road and turn their neighbourhood into a condominium. The wall was later demolished by the inhabitants of Polana Caniço. The second concerns a gentrification process whereby Sommerschild II expanded into Polana Caniço, due to the latter’s closeness to the city centre, beach and malls.

In chapters five and six the realm of religion and shopping malls are discussed as urban spaces which may provide the possibility of equality, with symmetrical relations and the unfolding of sociality and community across boundaries. Heer discusses how religious encounters between Indian and African Muslims in Maputo brought about mutual stereotypes and prejudices, and how the Christian churchgoers from Alexandra experienced informal micro-segregation.

In African cities, shopping malls are important spaces of public life that stand in particular relations to other urban spaces. They have layers of meanings and different forms. Heer discusses shopping malls as entangled spaces of heterotopia that involve multiple logics, an interplay between various binaries (public-private, normal-extraordinary, imagined-real, similar-dissimilar), and are, therefore, ambivalent

and antithetical. She focuses on the following aspects: (1) spatial practices by users, (2) representations of the malls, (3) encounters in malls, and (4) the relationship between the mall and the rest of the urban settings. Due to the nature of interactions and behaviours in the mall, people become more aware of the reality of urban society and of their social position in it.

The mall becomes a place where there is a chance of encounters across social boundaries linked with domestic work, religion and street life generally. There is variation among urban residents and lifestyles as to whether a mall is regarded as a normal place and whether it is part of the daily routine.

In conclusion, the lives of urban dwellers are intrinsically entangled, in spite of the fact that they lead different lives in adjacent but separate neighbourhoods.

**Henk Pauw**

Nelson Mandela University, Port Elizabeth,  
South Africa.

[henk.pauw@vodamail.co.za](mailto:henk.pauw@vodamail.co.za)

---

**Italo Pardo and Giuliana B. Prato (eds).**  
2019. *Legitimacy: Ethnographic and Theoretical Insights*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan; Series: Palgrave Studies in Urban Anthropology.

The most significant aspect of this edited volume of thirteen essays and an introduction is its timeliness. The legitimacy of the state, the moral authority of those in charge of the lives of the masses has never been under so much scrutiny as now. In the present times the ruler is ideally a representative of the people and as stated by Pardo authority without legitimacy is seen as authoritarianism and evokes

equivalent response. All states are founded upon some criteria of legitimacy, the least of which is election to power by a popular vote; yet these elected or selected authorities are not acceptable only by the legal and judicial process that gives them an overt right to rule. They can be and are actually challenged when they fail to deliver what the citizens cognitively understand as their cultural, economic and social rights. Rights and responsibilities are filtered through a moral screen of evaluation and judgment that connects the formal and the substantive, the legal and the emotional and the structural with the constructed reality. Pardo and Prato (p. 8) clarify this aspect as the distinction between the normative and empirical dimensions of legitimacy related to the social construction of legitimacy; in turn informed by the normative, the subjective, the daily experiences on the ground and the dreams and aspirations of ordinary citizens.

The essays in this volume, skilfully negotiate the relationship between the theoretical and the empirical as they interrogate legitimacy and the finer processes of governance. Several taken-for-granted concepts are dissected and analysed to provide a depth of understanding illuminating the varied dimensions and levels of empirical reality. For example, Prato (p. 37) takes up the concept of 'integrity' and how it is understood differentially by those ruled and those ruling, while Pardo (p. 62) clarifies the fine moral distinction between collective organized protest and that made by individuals for self-seeking goals, thereby bringing out the plurality of 'being with' and 'being in' community.

Although all the essays play around the central theme of legitimacy, each one of them brings a different historical and temporal context to the forefront. The empirical substantiation of the present draws meaning and validity from the linear and horizontal dimensions of historical and political events. An added merit of this volume is the widely dispersed ethnographic material brought together under one cover. Economic downslides and structural adjustments in Greece (Spyridakis), post-1990 financialization in Turkey and the state's involvement in legitimization of the financial exploitation by the banking sector (Atalay), upwardly mobile class formation in Colombia with deflection of authority to local communities in the urban housing sector (Hurtado-Tarazona) are some of the instances that indicate how economic liberalization and the increasing influence of international economic institutions like the World Bank are predatory influences on state authority. The direct relationship between the state and the people is fast turning into a three-way relationship with the state losing its power as compared to corporate entities. The interplay of local, national and global is seen in the essays on neighbourhood relations in Kerala, India (Abraham), in local urbanization in Kisumu, Kenya (Koechlin), and in the tensions of national, supranational loyalties in Lebanon (Mollica). A local political party in Lebanon, also doubles up as a semi-military organization and gains legitimacy through trust, thereby invoking Pardo and Prato's discussion on the link between legitimacy and trust. It is not legality, a point raised repeatedly in the various essays in this

volume, but trust and discharge of responsibility that evokes a sense of legitimacy on the ground. As described in the essay on the sinking of a boat in Korea (Sarfati), the leaders lose trust when they fail to empathise and relate emotionally to the people, especially at the time of crises and tragedy.

The overall aspiration of this volume is to dissect concepts and philosophical ideas into their multifaceted and multifarious aspects, levels and significance. Legitimacy for example may mean different things to different people, depending on their location in the power field and their goals and moral universe. The case of the Viger Square in Montreal (Boucher) illustrates how a park may have multiple meanings distributed among various stakeholders. The reason why the rulers and ruled may not agree even on formal and legal issues is that they often occupy different experiential and moral universe since cognitive perceptions are shaped by daily life experiences as well as by received history and generational narratives (Andrews, Krase and Krase).

This is a continued conversation that Pardo and Prato have been having with their readers and the academic world. Over several volumes and papers, they are engaged in elaborating on legitimacy as a specific dimension of urban life and governance taking off from Weber as the base.

Legitimacy of governance is at stake at many locations around the world like the Black Lives Matter protests erupting globally and there are threats and challenges to political regimes, striving to keep their stronghold in a dynamic and increasingly aware world. The true meaning of

urbanization probably can be seen in this awakening, questioning and not taking things as they are; in the search for equity, inclusion, diversity and justice.

**Subhadra Mitra Channa**

Delhi University

[channa.subhadra@gmail.com](mailto:channa.subhadra@gmail.com)

---

**Marco Zumaglini, Lucia Bozzola, Roberto Einaudi (eds) 2018. *Modern Rome: From Napoleon to the Twenty-First Century*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.**

Rome is not just another urban agglomeration. For centuries, even millennia, it defined what a city should be. Its powerful allure should offer precious lessons to city planners and place-makers, which is why the supple translation into English of Italo Insolera's classic *Roma Moderna* is such a welcome event

Insolera was an urban planner based in Rome for over fifty years until his death in 2012. He expanded his first history of how the city evolved as capital of united Italy, published in 1962, through many editions until the final one in 2011. This translation of that edition, *Modern Rome*, in turn includes much additional information provided by the translator-editors, Lucia Bozzola, Roberto Einaudi and Marco Zumaglini, along with Insolera's collaborators Vezio De Lucia and Paolo Berdini.

The latter, in his account of the current state of 'spatial management' in Rome, makes a disconcerting remark suggesting the paradoxical challenge underlying the whole enterprise, one which tempted Insolera himself to wonder if he should not add a question mark to his title: *Roma*

*Moderna?* Rome, Berdini writes, 'is smothered by missing rules.' Ultimately, the problem lies in the fact that key figures in municipal structures lack 'any sense of the public good.'

Urban planning in Rome has never been a smooth process, and historically its spectacular successes were often marked by violence since its foundation, or under the emperor Nero, the papal rulers and Napoleon. Insolera opened his final edition of *Roma Moderna* with an account of Napoleon's planning, which entailed humane social reforms along with grand physical improvements.

The real chance for renovation of the ancient papal city came about when Rome was made capital of a finally united Italy in 1870. Its new role naturally entailed significant expansion. But this is where the paradox mentioned above first appeared. Rome had given a system of law to much of the civilized world two thousand years earlier, and continued legislating for Christendom ever after. Yet now the city failed to come up with any effective plan for its own imminent growth.

Rome's history both as seat of the Catholic Church and as a city whose élite had long competed in its embellishment might have led one to expect resistance to the lure of real estate speculation. That was not to be the case. Both the Vatican and the land-owning Roman aristocracy vigorously eluded any restrictions on profiteering.

With the Roman élite and the Vatican itself pursuing profit through unregulated development, Insolera's account of the fate of urban planning in Rome could make for melancholy reading. And yet his tale is a

compelling one, because progress was made, even if only in fits and starts.

After unification, a most successful of outsiders, Ernesto Nathan — who had been born in London of Jewish parents and did not become an Italian citizen until age 40 — became mayor of Rome in 1907, and unclasped the aristocracy's hold on affairs. A city plan was approved, whose 'technical and planning precision', Insolera observes, was to 'remain unique throughout the history of urban planning in Rome.' After six years as mayor, however, Nathan was replaced by a Roman prince, Prospero Colonna.

Benito Mussolini, another outsider, made an impact of a different type. Four years before his 1922 rise to power, the principle that Rome's historical core should be preserved intact had been made official. Yet, Insolera deftly recounts, rational urban planning got no more traction during the following two decades than before. Mussolini's massive interventions were governed by one criterion: the cult of appearances. The *duce* had stated that 'Rome must appear wonderful to all peoples in the world...'

Insolera's attention to how urban planning, or its absence, affected the humbler classes is evident throughout *Modern Rome*. In both ancient and papal Rome, the poor had been co-opted into the civic whole by various means, bread and circuses under the empire, charity and religious rites under the popes. The Napoleonic master plan had been conceived not only in terms of place, but also of people, with humane provisions for both male and female labourers.

But after 1870, the presence of a potentially rebellious proletariat in the new capital had been viewed as risky, and peasants drawn from the countryside as construction workers found little provision had been made for their housing, which consisted at best of hovels. This situation worsened under Mussolini, whose demolition of entire neighbourhoods entailed displacement of tens of thousands of poor people, whom he sent to distant *borgate*, some of them in malaria-ridden countryside.

The notion that an old city could be improved by destroying pieces of it lingered even after World War II. Additional demolitions, euphemistically called 'thinning', were in the works.

In 1951, to facilitate traffic, the city was preparing to raze an extensive historical area near Piazza di Spagna. But Insolera reports that by now the concept of integral preservation of Rome's core had 'permeated the cultural mood.' Here the tireless activity of Insolera's great friend and fellow activist, Antonio Cederna, came into play. Cederna's passionate press crusade soon aroused public opinion from its torpor, and an effective environmental and preservation association, Italia Nostra, was founded. The planned demolitions were cancelled.

Yet city plans continued to be sabotaged, and the early 1960s witnessed the triumph of profiteering over planning. In an assault on Rome's surviving crown of green hills, echoing its destruction of Villa Ludovisi eighty years earlier, the Società Generale Immobiliare — of which the Vatican was a major shareholder — built a huge Hilton hotel atop Monte Mario in an area intended for parkland. This time,

however, there were consequences. Rome's mayor lost his seat in the uproar, and the Vatican ceded its dominant financial interest in the SGI to Michele Sindona, a shady financier who bankrupted the company (and in 1999 was poisoned in prison).

Insolera analyses the shift in the capital's situation in the 1970s, beginning with Pope Paul VI's affirmation that the shanty dwellers on Rome's outskirts were living in 'as yet private protest' against 'the consumer city's shameless luxury.' Rome's parish priests and Catholic organizations have followed through with actions to improve life in the chaotic periphery.

Efforts to expand and protect public green spaces and to limit motorized traffic continued and often succeeded in the following decades. But implementation of city planning, of an overall vision of what a better Rome might be, was no easier than before. Unauthorized housing continued to be the norm rather than the exception, and progress, such as it was, was entrusted to the preparation of 'special events' like the 1990 soccer World Cup or the 2000 Holy Year Jubilee.

Urban advances brought about in function of special events were perforce fragmentary, and Insolera laments 'the annihilation of planning' after 1990. He nonetheless kept alive a high sense of what might give Romans a better urban experience, despite the haphazard quality of the city's daily governance. Here, as throughout this generous chronicle, he focuses on both material and cultural improvements.

Materially, his ideal for the Rome to come would be the enhancement and enlargement of the wedge of archaeology and greenery that begins at the very centre

of Rome, the Capitoline Hill, and extends through the imperial forums, reaching the Circus Maximus and the Baths of Caracalla, and then widening on either side of the ancient Appian Way to the foot of the Alban Hills, giving a clear form to the city midst the otherwise encompassing sprawl.

The cultural shift that engendered hope in Insolera was Rome's increasing multi-ethnicity. The city historically has been extraordinarily open to immigration, with its original inhabitants coming from all over and citizenship open even to children of freed slaves (The more sophisticated Greeks were astounded at this openness). Roman emperors often hailed from distant provinces, and the Roman church welcomed all and sundry by its very nature. Insolera caught a glimpse of an enriched future in the harmonies created by a multi-ethnic ensemble, the Piazza Vittorio Orchestra, whose members and music and instruments come from a picturesque variety of places.

In addition to an abundance of photographs and maps, along with an excellent index, this meticulous book has a useful glossary of terms of urban planning in Rome, as well as a concise description of local and national governmental bodies.

**Barringer Fifield**

[barryrome1@gmail.com](mailto:barryrome1@gmail.com)